CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

Sri M. C. NARASIMHAN.—Sir, I beg to call the attention of the Hon'ble Minister for Labour, Animal Husbandry, Fisheries and Sericulture to the continuance of the strike in Somalkar Factory at Harihar.

Sri K. V. SHANKARA GOWDA.—Sir, this may be taken up to-morrow, as the Hon'ble Minister is held-up in the other House.

Mr. CHAIRMAN.—All right.

MESSAGE FROM THE GOVERNOR

Announcement.

Mr. CHAIRMAN.—I report to the House that I have received a message from the Governor which is as follows :—

> " To the Members of the Mysore Legislative Council : I have received with great satisfaction the expression of your thanks for the speech with which I opened the First session, 1968 of both Houses of the Legislature.
>
> G. S. PATHAK."

NON-OFFICIAL RESOLUTION *Re* : APPOINTING A COMMITTEE TO GO INTO THE WORKING OF THE SEVERAL MEDICAL COLLEGES IN THE STATE

(*Debate contd.*)

Mr. CHAIRMAN.—Mr. Ganjiveerappa to continue his speech.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA (Graduates' Constituency).—Since Mr. Ganji Veerappa is not present, I may be permitted to speak.

Mr. CHAIRMAN.—Yes.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—Sir, I wish to make a few remarks on the resolution brought forward by Dr. Bandi Gowda on the desirability of appointing a Committee to go into the working of several Medical Colleges in the State, so that their recommendations would be conducive to the improvement of the State Colleges. Sir, in the preliminary remarks Dr. Bandi Gowda was enumerating the causes for the rush of having medical education. He was saying that boys and girls vie with each other to get into the M.B.B.S. course and I can well understand that they rush because of all the technical educational courses, it is the medical education that is now, at the moment, affording possibilities

of good employment prospects. Sir, lightly speaking as we all know that in the marriage market it is next to I.A.S. and I.P.S. It is the medical graduate that gets the largest amount of consideration at the hands of parents of the eligible girls. The parents look out first for I.A.S. or I.P.S. and if they are not available, then they lookout for medical graduates.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA (Legislative Assembly Constituency).—If the Hon'ble Member yields—If it is the Girl that is medical graduate does she resciprocate similarly ?

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—Of late, every medical graduate girl is getting married to a graduate Doctor with the result they are together setting-up either to practice or working in some hospital. Hence, the rush is more for this course. The pressure is brought about by parents on the Medical College authorities to see that admissions are given to their children or wards and to see that the number of admissions are increased to the maximum. Sir, I myself am a mother of a youngman who wanted to study for medical course and I was not able to get a seat for him. I was also told I could not get a seat even under the political sufferers because I had not put in the required 8 months attendance in the jail, 8 months in the jail enabled a person to be called a political sufferer. So, I took up the challenge and I have sent him to the College in Karnatak University to study B.Sc. part I leading to Medicine. In the meanwhile, I went to the medical colleges to see for myself how they worked. I made a pilgrimage to Manipal. I saw St. John Medical College. I saw one or two other colleges. I saw how the first two colleges selected candidates. The St. John Medical College makes the best of selection possible and it is a matter which needs emulation by the Government Medical colleges also. In St. John's Medical College, I found in addition to personality test, in addition to interview, they have what is called a comprehensive test. They make psychological test; they set test papers. In a word they test the candidates in so many ways that they are absolutely sure that the boy or the girl is fit to take that course. I think it is very necessary to have such a preliminary comprehensive and thorough scientific examination so that there may be less number incompetent students to go in for medical education. In Manipal to see that there is no wastage at various levels of MBBS, they have intensive coaching scheme for those students who fail in various examinations so that nobody stayed in the same class for more than one or two years. Sir, in Government colleges, I am afraid neither his method nor the other method is followed. It is merely an interview method. Secondly, there is a good deal of wastage at various levels. Sir, in regard to equipment, we have listened to Dr. Bandi Gowda when he printed out that some of the colleges are lacking in equipment. It may be true in some of the private colleges ; it may be also true that some of the sophisticated equipments are not properly made use of at all. I am told very reliably that some of the sophisticated equipments which arrived from abroad are lying

(SMT. M. R. LAKSHAMMA)

in the cases unopened and some equipments cannot be made use of because there is no person competent to make use of these sophisticated equipments. There is also this fact that when once these equipments go out of order, or some little screw goes away, there is nobody who is competent to repair them and put them back into working condition. So much so, Sir, I would like to make a constructive suggestion in this behalf that it is very necessary to have a sort of workshop attached to every college and particularly to a college in a City like Bangalore. Sir, it is even necessary to have a sort of correlation between the Engineering Course on the one hand and the repair work in respect of these medical colleges on the other. There is such a course as instrumentation course as one of the courses of Engineering. We should see that this course is opened in the Engineering Colleges. It would be worthwhile to see that these students are made to attend to repair of these sophisticated equipments. Sir, in advanced countries like Japan, Germany, young people take hold of old junks of machines dismantle them and reassemble them try to produce prototype cars so that in course of time, they become experts in the line. Unfortunately, here if a bolt is broken, if some little thing is misplaced, we are at the mercy of technical people. We have to wait till there parts are imported by spending huge foreign exchange and in the meanwhile we allow them to lie unused. I feel it is necessary that we should have a medical workshop attached to at least one or two major medical colleges in our State.

I am told in regard to medical colleges that admission is far in excess of what should be the reasonable limit. Even the Davangere Medical College, has come in for a good deal of criticism in this respect. This point was being supported and defended vehemently by Mr. Ganji Veerappa. I am told that a recommendation has been made to admit as many as 150 students by a committee very recently. Considering the fact that according to Dr. Bandi Gowda Davangere Medical College is woefully inadequate as regards necessary equipment, I wonder whether it would not be wise to see that these admissions are restricted and selections are made more scientifically. Before I say a few words about Manipal medical college, I would like to say a few words on the staff in general on the chemical side, the staff is said to be adequate ; but on the anatomy side, I hear the staff is not adequate. This certainly needs to be corrected. I am also told reliably that certain of the posts of staff cannot be filled up because of the restrictions imposed by the Mysore Public Service Commission Rules and Regulations. I feel, Sir, it is necessary even to liberalise and relax these rules if medical education is to progress satisfactorily. It is very necessary to err on the liberal side as regards staff rather than be bound by rules and regulations. Rules and regulations are after all meant to subserve the ends so they must be relaxed and liberalised when necessity demands.

Sri J. B. MALLARADHYA (Legislative Assembly Constituency).—What is the restriction now imposed which is sought to be relaxed? How does it prevent recruitment of staff? If they are unqualified with reference to prescribed qualifications, they certainly cannot be employed. I want to know details about it.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—I would like to tell the details to Sri Mallaradhya, out side if he wants. But here I can say this much: because of these rules, posts are not filled up because as advertised they do not get the candidates of the required qualifications. These rules will have to be relaxed in case you wish to have the necessary staff.

Sri J. B. MALLARADHYA.—If they are not qualified, we cannot insist on their being taken. If they are qualified, the P.S.C. does not come in the way.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—It is not a question of relaxing the academic qualification. It is a question of relaxing qualification as regards communities. I am sure Sri Mallaradhya can understand it and if these rules come in the way, it is better that the rules are relaxed. In regard to teaching hospitals which are absolutely necessary if medcal education is to go on satisfactorily. It is suggested that there should be a periphery on hospitals, all around in a city like Bangalore, there should be of hundred bedded general hotspitals type, the Victoria hospital there can cater to the special cases and serve the special needs, in which case there would not that rush in the victoria hospitals and it would give the much needed attention to the patients who go to the hospital seeking special attention for their ailments. In this respect, I would urge the Government to take up the construction of hospitals in Jayanagar area because it is a large expanding area; it is very necessary to have a good hospital in this area. It is also necessary to have a hospital in an area like Binmangala. In a few years, it may be necessary to have another hospital in Rajajinagar so that the Victoria Hospital may be left to serve the special needs of patients. In this way, we can also ensure and safeguard that special attention will be paid to the needy patients.

In regard to the nursing staff no amonnt of medical education would be successful if there is no complement of the required number of auxiliary midwives and other staff of this nature, I am told here in the City of Bangalore recently, some appliattions were called for auxiliary midwives courses. Till now the plea of the Government was that not enough women were coming forward to undergo this training. This time, I am told that as many as 500 women applied for the auxiliary midwivery courses.

Sri V. SREENIVASA SHETTY (Graduates' Constituency).—Do midwives come under this Resolution?

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—I was referring to medical education and as part of that education, this point arises.

(SMT. M. R. LAKSHAMMA)

In regard to 500 applicants, I am told they made hardly 30 selections and the rest of them were rejected not because they were not eligible, but because the Government had felt the need only for 30 of them. It makes me feel that in view of the fact that it is very necessary to provide for nursing homes also, well-equipped in this matter of auxiliary midwives, it may be necessary to see that a large number at—a hundred are allowed to undergo this course. I am told that some of the women applicants were deserted, widows, cried piteously and pathetically before the selection officers for being selected, and these selections officers were moved to the quick at their plight. In view of the fact that the Government is socialistic in its aim, and it is a welfare Government, it is necessary to rehabilitate a larger number of women by making them take up such courses.

Sir, in regard to buildings, I am told that the Government hospitals are at a disadvantage because they are asked to have certain contributions, the State contribution which the Government is not in a position to give. Either it is not in a position to give or has not given, with the result that the private colleges which are prepared to give their part of the contributions, are able to get the Central assistance, so much so, they are much better off in the matter of buildings than Government hospitals. Therefore, it is better that the Governments comes to the rescue of their own medical colleges and see that necessary buildings are put up.

In regard to other environmental facilities that are so necessary for students, I made a pilgrimage to manipal—what a campus, what a college and what an array of epuipment! It is not a college located in crowded localities of the Cities. The whole city of Manipal is built for the sake of college campus. It is meant for students. Every student has got residential facilities which are denied even to students in Bangalore. I was surprised to see the amount of equipment that they have, the kind of charts that they have got prepared. It was a thrill of joy for me when I saw some of the charts; the nerves of a person are actually removed from the human body and painted and exhibited in such a manner, that even a lay person like me can understand the anatomy of the human being. I am sure that such an exhibition is not found in any of the colleges in the country. I went to the Library. The College has a huge library. When I went to see it, I was surprised to see quite a number of students. I asked them, where do you come from? one of them said, he was from Malaya. I questioned him, how is it you heard of this College and have come thus far? He replied, he knew about the reputation of the college. "The fame of this college has spread far and wide. So, I have come here to prosecute my studies," This is certainly a matter for thrill of joy. Then I saw the Dairy, adjacent to the Campus. I asked the Registrar, what is it that they were doing in that foremost requisite for the students, *i.e.*, milk. Milch

cattle do not thrive in the Malnad area. He explained how they are experimenting there on the kind of grass that could grow also to find out there and the kind of milch cattle that can flourish and thrive under those climatic conditions. The excellence of an institution is dependent upon the environmental facilities provided for the students. It has been so much emphasised by the Robbins education Committee of England. Robbins Committee, which has been claimed to be one of the best Committees going, has rightly emphasised on the environmental conditions of an educational institute. I feel sir, if the environmental conditions have to be satisfactory, students must have creature comferts, good food, milk, eggs, butter and so on. So, the manipal College authorities like to find out the type of cattle that would flourish there so that they might rear them and keep the students in comfortable position. ಅನ್ನದ ತಪ್ಪಲೆಯಲ್ಲಿ ಅನ್ನ ಆಗಿದೆಯೇ ಇಲ್ಲವೇ ಎನ್ನುವುದು ಒಂದು ಅಗಳು ಪಸಿಕ ನೋಡಿದರೆ ಗೊತ್ತಾಗುತ್ತದೆ. ಹಾಗೆಯೇ here is a really excellent institution because it is so foreseeing in its plans. I also went through the literature that was given to me and I was happy to know that some of the older students who have graduated from this institution, have agreed not only to serve in this institution but also donate some considerable amounts; showing thereby that they have demonstrated their love towards this College. The love of a student towards the College which gave him good education, is certainly a pointer to the excellence of that institution.

I am aware of the fact that the College depends upon the capitation fees. It was started by Dr. T.M.A. Pai because a poor boy was denied a seat in the Medical College; he was deserving of a seat in the Medical College. Dr. Pai, that wizard, took this to hear and made up his mind to build up a medical college. That is the genesis of this wonderful institution so unequalled in its enterprising spirit. Thus the institution started its humble beginnings. Today it is a major institution. But I am told without any capitation fee they are having some poor boys. Some other poor boys are given loans by the Canara Syndicate Bank so that they might prosecute their studies on this basis. The kind of enteprising spirit of this institution was demonstrated to me in another manner during my visit. The son of the Registrar, a young boy, was collecting one rupee from every visitor that came to the house; you see, quite a number of visitors come to their house. This boy was collecting only one rupee per visitor. For what purpose? To see that a Children's Ward is put up as part of this institution.

The utmost silence in the Hospital, the cleanliness of the Hospital, the trim spotlessly white uniform of the nurses, etc. are all indication of the fact that here is an institution worthy of encouragement. I know the feelings that some of the members are harbouring about this institution. They are up against capitation fees. But I blame the people thoroughly who take receipt for Rs. 5,000 and give Rs. 30,000. Who asked them to give Rs. 30,000? They pay because their demand for admission is so keen that they would like to secure admission at any cost and not like to wait in queue.

3-15 P.M.

ಶ್ರೀ ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟಸ್ವಾಮಿ (ಆರೋಗ್ಯ ಮತ್ತು ವಸತಿ ಶಾಖೆಗಳ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು).—ಮೂವತ್ತು ಸಾವಿರ ತೆಗೆದುಕೊಂಡು ಐದು ಸಾವಿರಕ್ಕೆ ರಶೀದಿ ಕೊಡುತ್ತಾರೆ ಎಂದು ಯಾರು ಹೇಳಿದರು ? ಇದನ್ನು ಈ ರೀತಿ ಹೇಳಿದವರು ಯಾರು ? They are expected to give receipt for the actual amount they receive.

Sri J. B. MALLARADHYA.—The hon'ble lady is talking of the Manipal College. ನಾನು ಮಣಿಪಾಲ ಕಾಲೇಜು ಹೆಸರು ಕೂಡ ಹೇಳಲಿಲ್ಲ.

Sri JEEVARAJ HIRACHAND SHAH (Ligislative Assembly Constituency).—This practice is going on not only in Manipal College but in every college.

Sri M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—I am speaking of Manipal College. But wherever capitation fee exists not only in Manipal College but in every private college, such things have occured. To whomsoever this cap fits in, they can wear. I am not here to defend the practice of receiving Rs. 30,000 and giving receipt for Rs. 5,000. I wish that responsible people should not give Rs. 30,000. Where they have got receipt for Rs. 5,000. I like neither of the practices. Like a historian, I keep my mind open. I am free from bias. I am commenting because Mr. Mallaradhya made a statement to this effect. I have no personal knowledge of this, I am talking on principle. Nobody would defend unfair practices. Everybody knows that every private college is now demanding a capitation sum of Rs. 5,000 ; and in regard to outside candidates something like Rs. 10 thousand. The question arises are we to go without these facilities or are we to defend them ? The question boils down to this : As long as there is rush for these colleges, I do not see why these colleges should not give seats to those who can afford to pay five thousand rupees and also in addition, the expenses of the course, because, in all, it amouuts to Rs. 22,000 for the full course. If a person can afford, he may give. After all, hon'ble member Sri Srinivasa Shetty must realise that even if he sends a student to the ordinary institute, there also it does amount to three or four thousand rupees per year including books and other expenditures. Now that Manipal has set an example every private institution is copying. So much so those who can afford will have education. But we can certainly find fault with the system if they admit boys who may not be up to the mark. If they do not have the minimum, they should not be admitted.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—Does not the hon'ble member know in a number of cases such a thing has happened in Manipal College and other colleges ?

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—Mininum marks is fixed by the University and boys who get less than that cannot get a seat.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—I may tell for the information of the hon'ble member that a daughter of the Register did not get a seat and she was asked to study again because she had obtained less than the minimum.

Sri K. R. ACHAR (Legislative Assembly Constituency).—This minimum was not there formerly at all. Because of these things, the minimum of 45 is fixed now.

Sri K. PUTTASWAMY.—According to the academic conditions of the University it is 40; but according to the standard fixed by Government, it is 45 marks.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—Sir, we must talk of to-day and to-day only. To-day the University rules hold good and nobody who gets less than the minimum marks is admitted in any of the private colleges. Sir, as I said, it is a matter which Government should take into consideration in regard to the conditions in the medical colleges, specially, Government colleges and see that the conditions are improved.

But, Sir, I am at a loss to understand how the conditions could be utterly deplorable because according to the reports that are supplied to us as Academic Council members of Bangalore University, we get to know the conditions existing at least in two of the colleges *i.e.*, Bangalore Medical College and St. John's Medical College. Conditions obtaining in those two colleges are gone into by a Committee which consists of a representative of the All-India Medical Council and Doctors who are eminent authorities in their field. I have knowledge that these committees have gone into the conditions obtaining in these medical colleges; they have recommended that post-graduate courses be opened as the necessary facilities are obtainable in these colleges. I fail to understand how the conditions in these colleges are deplorable. There may be some deficiency but I do not know how they can be termed as deplorable in the light of the findings of the people who are eminent in their respective fields.

Sir, with regard to the other alternative courses to neutralize the rush into the medical colleges, there was a suggestion that B.Scs. for public health may be trained. I brought that literature to the notice of the hon'ble Minister for Health and some how he felt that the scheme could wait for one year. At least this year they can take it up because it gets 50 per cent grant from the Central Government. It is to train the candidates in public health and then appoint them in the various municipalities. A question was asked by a Doctor as to what will happen to the Health Inspectors; what happens to them? Sir, it is very necessary to-day when the need of the public health is many and manifold and various, to have a person of the calibre of B.Sc. in public health, a man with half baked knowledge even though he might have years of experience will not be as efficient as the B.Sc. trained candidate. I suggest to the Government to have this experimental measure tried and see that the rush to medical colleges is reduced a little at least. I want the Government to adopt the suggestion of Dr. Monteiro who suggests to institute M.Sc. Degree courses for non-medical graduates in the subjects of Anatomy, Physiology, Biochemistry, Pharmacology and Microbiology. He says that the medical education is

(SMT. M. R. LAKSHAMMA)

becoming vast and complex; with the large number disciplines and the rapid advances in the various fields and the needs of medical care that an expanding and educated population demands, it has become difficult to have adequate number of medical men to meet these demands. The problem is more acute in the pre-clinical and the paraclinical subjects where there is a shortage of teachers and research workers.

Sir, as we know, research is a very vital factor in education and the more researeh we undertake, the better it is, for any educational field. Dr. Menteiro further says: "This shortage is almost universal and has been remedied to a great extent by employing non-medical scientists, to fill up positions in Anatomy, Physiology Pharmacology, Biochemistsy and Microbiology. Medical education and research cannot progress without a sound basis in these subjects. Under the circumstances stated above, it is desirable and necessary to introduce courses in these subjects as early as possible."

I fully agree that it is very necessary at this stage to institute M.Sc. courses for these subjects for non-medical graduates. If steps have already been taken, I am very happy about it. It should be introduced in all the Universities, so that it may provide employment possibility to a great number of students who qualify for medical degree and who cannot get seats in those colleges. I was saying that while conditions are not very satisfactory in the colleges, it is necessary for the Government to take steps to see that wherever conditions are not up to the mark steps are instituted so that the madical colleges may be really temples of learning; in regard to capitation fees, to see no undue exploitation of capitation fees is allowed to exist. At the same time I would not condemn the capitation fee as such. I would encourage those institutions for they are really useful to the extent they absorb extra students whom the Government medical colleges are unable to absorb. I also urge that those scientific equipments which are lying unused in various institutions, colleges as well as hospitals should be made use of at the earlist possible time by having a workshop opened as an adjunct to the colleges.

I thank you for giving me an opportunity to speak.

† SRI V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—Sir, I had half a mind not to speak on this resolution. I am not an expert in medicine. But having read the speeches made by my hon'ble friends Sri M. P. L. Sastry and Sri Ganji Veerappa when I was in South Kanara and now having heard the hon'ble lady member Smt. M. R. Lakshamma I am tempted to say a few words. According to the lady member we are governed by a socialistic Government where education should be free or at least equal opportunities should be given to all the boys. There is no difference of opinion about it. Of course, things are a little better now. There was a time when admissions were given to these medical

colleges without the hampering of any rules or regulations or merits of demerits. Even to the Government colleges admissions were given. Now with regard to the admissions of the colleges, things have improved. Why I say this is, at least three of my friends have taken up the cause of these colleges, pessibistically, called as capitation colleges. My hon'ble friend who went on a pilgrimage to the college which inspired all these institutions has described with what humility she went there and what she saw there is entheralling.

Smt M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—I did make a pilgrimage and I am really impressed with what I saw. Any good educational institution, I would certainly regard as a place of pilgrimage.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—The hon'ble lady member styled the whole thing as hook, line, sinker; she went, she saw and she conquered. It may be otherwise. What did she see? what did she hear; how much did she believe ?

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—I was impressed with the South-Kanara genius.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—Naturally, one visit will not be enough. One thing is, I have been consistently saying rightly or wrongly from the beginning, that the rich should not be given weightage with regard to seats. Simply because is a person rich, his children should not have weightage in the matter of education. The very fact that a person can give Rs. 50,000 or one lakh for a duffer son—and we know the methods of his passing—proves how wrong it is. It is not only making him enter but also making him pass to become a doctor. I can challenge that this is done day in and day out. The hon'ble lady member and other freinds in this House say what is wrong with capitation, what is wrong in spending 50,000 to his son.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—Only those who are eligible are made to pass.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—I will give one instance. Is it not a fact that in the St. John's College a boy whose close relation is one of the highest personages in the State got an entry, not because he got marks ? Without any qualification he managed to get entry. By what means, we know. It is no wonder that this boy got an entry.

Sri K. PUTTASWAMY.—The procedure that the college follows in selecting the students is that they hold an examination on an all-India basis and of the students that appear they select the first 100 and these first hundred are subjected to a very severe interview. Out of 100 boys 50 boys are selected. If the son of an hon. Member of this House or the other House or the son of a person placed in a high position gets selected, it is not the fault of the method, it is because of the brightness of the boy that he gets selected.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—Everybody will admit that if he is not a bright boy he will not get admitted. We know the facts. That is why I said that all of us are adults. The minimum mark for admission fixed in St. John's College or Manipal College or Davangere College is 45. Can anybody assure us that boys who have got less than 45 marks have not been admitted to any of these colleges ?

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—They cannot admit because the Mysore University has fixed a certain minimum for admission.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—Shall I give one instance with regard to Manipal ? A few years ago, without getting permission for the condensed course, they went on admitting boys and Government had to pull them up.

Sri M. P. L. SASTRY.— (Nominated).—The condensed courses were run for the Licentiates *i.e.*, the L. M. Ps by the Mysore University. Therefore, for the hon. Member Srinivasa Shetty to say that they did not possess the minimum qualifications for being admitted to the colleges and for the condensed course is not correct. Suppose the University had said that only those who got above 45 per cent...

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—My friend is mis-quoting. The rules do not apply to these institutions. The Government made a rule that Manipal should admit only a certain number of boys but they went on admitting double the number. Afterwards, Government had to pull them up.

Sri M. P. L. SASTRY.—Every admission that is made in an affiliated college, even in the Arts and Science Colleges, will have to be approved by the University.

3-45 P.M.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—That is so. Rules are made only to be broken sometimes. We know that these minimum qualifications are there. In the Mysore State there are a number of boys who have got 70 to 80 per cent marks and yet they could not find a place in the Medical Colleges. Nor are they able to pay the capitation fees. Are they not entitled for seats in the State ? Boys from all over the world, from Singapore, Africa and Punjab come and get admission into this college, but what about our own boys who cannot go outside ? Hereafter, because of Hindi we will not have a place outside. Most brilliant boys in the State who are poor and are not in a position to pay the capitation fee will not be able to get admission into these colleges. The Lady Member was made to understand that for the sake of a very poor indigent boy this institution was started. It is only a truism. There is no limit for the capitation fee ; sky is the only limit. Ordinarily, under the rules it is Rs. 5,000 but it has gone up even to Rs. 50,000 I do not know how ordinary people like me can afford such a huge amount. Will the defenders of this institution be able to say that all the amount above Rs. 5,000 that has been taken as

capitation fees has found entry into the accounts books of this institution ? The accounts have not shown more than Rs. 5,000 per student. When was this institution started ? Supposing every year 200 students are admitted into this college, the amount that will have been collected will be staggering. What has happened to that money ? Why do you blame a man taking a bribe of few rupees or a trader indulging in blackmarketing in some consumer article ? When you are tolerating this blackmarketing in education, what is wrong in another man making some money because he is unable to eke out a livelihood ? The moral standard of my hon'ble Lady Friend is elastic.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—What is the justification for the hon. Member to make remarks that my moral standard is elastic ?

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—If the Hon'ble Lady member has some other word to describe this method, I have no objection to accepting it. I will stick to my view that this is pure blackmarketing and nothing else. Morally speaking, there is no justification for this system of blackmarketing.

I agree that it has got a fairly good standard, good teaching staff, good library, etc. I have nothing to say against it. But, whether he is a musician or a wizard, I do object to this method of running educational institutions. In the nature of things, it is not possible to entertain only boys of high standard. It is only because the boys are unable to get seats in other Colleges that they go there.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—I can give instances. Even first class boys who got 70 per cent of marks have gone to this College.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—Exceptions do not prove the rule. I know there are a few exceptions. But, in a large majority of cases, it is only boys who are unable to get entry in other Colleges have gone there.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—It is because a boy who gets 45 or 50 per cent of the marks is not made out to be or come out to be a good doctor.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—I bow down to the hon'ble lady member with regard to the method of argument. According to the lady member, marks is not the criterion. On what else can we judge the intelligence of a boy ? I will give a clear example. Mr. Churchill, who failed in Mathematics became the Chancellor of the University. Whatever it is, the Selection Committee can judge only from the marks obtained. From the nature of things I should say that boys who have got very low marks enter these colleges by paying black-money. The Government, not only now, but for a long time have agreed that these private institutions should not exist-exceptions apart. They had practically conceded that as far as possible these institutions should be in the hands of the Government and the Government should have overall control. I know they made all efforts to control the Manipal institution. But, they failed, because Manipal institution has gone to fantastic heights now.

Sri K. R. ACHAR.—The Hon'ble Chief Minister only said that they are trying to take up these institutions one by one, two immediately and the others later on.

Sri J. B. MALLARADHYA.—I don't think the Government can take the Manipal College.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—I had a discussion with one of them who conceded that it is rather difficult to force them and take over this college. Sir, number of speeches have been made that they are going to take over this College. But, this is an impossibility. One other valid argument also comes in the way, *i.e.*, when the Government themselves are not running their own institutions in an efficient manner what justification is there for them to take over institutions which are being run in a fairly efficient manner. That is the only argument that comes in the way. Now that the Government of India have come down to reduce the number of admissions, I would say that even if there is reduction in the number of seats, it is far better that the Government take over this institution, and the sooner it is done the better. I do agree that some institutions may be stronger politically, who can wield more influence. The Government will be facing hornets'nest.

Sri K. VISWANATHASWAMY (Local Authorities Constituency).—If the financial condition does not permit them to take over all the institutions, what alternative method do you suggest? Do you think that the statutory restrictions on the capitation fee would be required?

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—I would agree to this capitation fee even. If the capitation fee is received by the Selection Committee and is utilised for the College, I have no objection. Selections must be done by an independent Committee without any influence by the institution. There cannot be any injustice in that respect. But if the House feels that private institutions should be there, I do feel that these institutions should exist; let all the private institutions exist. I know what all practices are prevailing in private schools.

Sri VISWANATHASWAMY.—Receipts are issued for the amount paid!

Mr. CHAIRMAN.—How much more time does the hon'ble member require?

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—Another 15 minutes, Sir.

Mr. CHAIRMAN.—The hon'ble member may continue after the recess.

The House will now rise and meet again at 4-30 P.M.

The House rose at Four of the Clock to re-assemble at Thirty Minutes past Four of the Clock.

The House re-assembled at Thirty Minutes past Four of the Clock.

[MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair].

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—I was referring specifically to Manipal Medical College. But it is a question of degree with regard to the Medical Colleges at Belgaum, Davangere and Gulbarga. All these Medical Colleges are trying to take lessons from the Manipal College. Several methods are being followed by these Colleges. I suggest that the Government must see that proper supervision is made over the collection of the fees in these Colleges. Whatever the amount collected from the students should go to the welfare of the Institution and let not the management collect the fees. The selection of the boys should be made under the supervision of the Government. It is not the Medical College alone that is doing this. They have started a Dental College. I believe Rs. 3,000 is being collected in this college. There are about half a dozen Colleges in this place. In all these Colleges this system is being followed. Same method for selection of students is followed. It is true that the Mysore University passed a resolution saying that from the year 1961 this system of taking capitation fee should be discontinued. One unfortunate thing is, this fact was not published in any news papers. The people in the field ought to know all these things. But they do not know anything about this at all.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—They have been prohibited to take the money in advance.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—Even that is not known to anybody. I do not know whether they have stopped taking money. If anybody wants a transfer certificate in the middle of the course, no amount will be returned. They refuse to give back the money that is paid in advance. For instance I tell you, a boy who is the son of Dr. Patel, wanted a transfer certificate to go to Bombay. They demanded some amount to give a certificate. In addition to what he had paid earlier, he was asked to pay something more. It has become a jungle law and not a man made law, that is prevailing in Manipal and at a lesser degree in other Colleges. What is the fee they are collecting? It is about Rs. 15 thousand. This state of affairs should not be allowed to continue. This system is being copied by other Colleges. This malady has spread even in Bangalore and other Colleges. Now-a-days it is difficult to get seats in the case of poor students because of this malady. Unless the Government takes severe steps in this regard, the position will not improve. The Government must look to the interests of the students and see that such things are checked in the Mysore State.

Sri J. B. MALLARADHYA.—I suggest the Government may take all the fees and run the institutions by themselves.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—I have no objection if the Government takes all the fees and start institutions like this. I have no objection if the people are prepared to pay. Let the money be utilised for the welfare of the State. But the Government is not willing to do

(SRI V. SRINIVASA SHETTY)

that. Such beneficial things do not appear to them good. But they simply say that we are going to check these mal-practices, and we are doing something in the matter. Our previous Health Minister made a long statement and came to this conclusion of taking over these colleges. But what is the result? He was wiped out of the scene. His critics came to a conclusion that he should be wiped out of the scene altogether. They succeeded in their attempt. This was the result of his statement. He has to thank them. I am not referring to my Hon'ble friend. It may not be so easy for him to come to Mysore and wipe out. Anywhere in India, they are capable. I have felt their pinch also to a certain extent. I know what they are capable of doing. They have not the least scruple to do any of these things. So, having come to such a position, I confess they have been able to harm me to a considerable extent. The blackmarketeer who has amassed money is able to purchase seats; he is able to make legislators. They are important people in the political life of the country.

Sri K. KANTHAPPA SHETTY (Legislative Assembly Constituency).—Can he give an example? I know several money bags cannot get seats. I can give you names.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—They are able to finance candidates. They are a very dangerous set. There is no doubt about it. Anyhow, the Government should not give scope to these people. The Government should not allow this worst practice of blackmarket to thrive in education. The previous Education Minister was saying that he was prepared to hand over all educational institutions to private bodies. He made a statement that he was willing to hand over governmental institutions to private bodies. In the Government also, we have got certain policies helpful to these people. That is the way our Government is working. I whole heartedly support the resolution to see that a high-powered committee is appointed to do something in the matter radically and not tinker with it so that such things are not repeated and perpetuated.

I would like to say one or two things about the medical colleges in general. I listened and learnt from other friends that teaching staff should be of a certain standard. There should be definite rules for the selection of teaching staff. As far as I can understand, the doctors in these medical colleges are supposed to be the best in the world. What I found till now is that a doctor who was running a primary health centre or a L.F. Dispensary and who has passed MBBS may be transferred to the Medical College though for a number of years he was working in a small institution catering to villagers. I feel certain standard and certain conditions should be prescribed for selection of lecturers and Professors in Medical Colleges. Tom, Dick or Harry who has passed MBBS should not be shunted to medical college as Lecturer, Assistant Professor or Professor. For the last several years we have been seeing that

there were no cadre and recruitment rules. One *mantra* that came from the Minster was that it is being drafted. I do not know how many times that statement was made in this House. For the last several years, this is being repeated. I request the Hon'ble Minister and the Government to see that only the best doctors are selected as lecturers and professors in the interest of efficient medical eduaction.

4-45 P.M.

The teacher should be able to command the respect of the students. If the students go on laughing at the lecturer or professor while he lectures or teaches, then there is no study at all. In this respect, Kasturba Medical College is much better than Government Medical college. I request the Government therefore to see that medical practitioner who is running a primary health centre is not shifted as lecturer to Medical College. Strict rules should be framed for the recruitment of lecturers and professors.

Sri K. PUTTASWAMY.—Rules are framed in the month of September last and recruitment is going on.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—I am told, subject to correction, that instruments which have been donated by UNICIF are misused and unused. I have got particulars about them but it may not be fair to give them unless I am myself satisfied about the truth of the allegations. I gave the example of Agricultural University where in the name of very efficient instruments we can purchase very bad instruments and then bill for best instruments. My information is that it was being done here also. I place it before the Hon'ble Minister for his information. As the Hon'ble Lady Member said, they are most eligible boys in the marriage market. Apart from that, the Medical Department is one of the most important departments in the State. The health of the whole State depends upon medical graduates and medical officers. If the Government manufactures all sorts of medical graduates, they will be able to kill people rather than save them. It is the paramount duty and the concern of the State and the public to see that these institutions are improved earlier and proper teaching is given to these boys. Something must be done with regard to private institutions who are a menace to the society.

†**Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.**—Mr. Chairman Sir, the resolution moved by Dr. Bandi Gowda reads thus :—

> "This Council is of opinion that a Committee be appointed to go into the working of several medical colleges in the State and to recommend measures for their improvement."

This pre-supposes that the medical colleges in the State are not functioning up to our expectation and require improvement and hence, it has been suggested that a committee be constituted to go into their functioning and recommend to the Government or to the concerned body

(SRI K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA)

how best they can be improved. An amendment has also been tabled to say that the committee proposed should be a committee of experts. I followed the speeches made in support and against the resolution.

Sri J. B. MALLARADHYA.—Nobody has opposed so far.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—Sir, the Hon'ble Member Sri Mallaradhya is busy with something else and has been in and out of the House so often. Perhaps he has missed the speech of Sri Ganji Veerappa who opposed the appointment of the Committee to go into this matter.

Sir, the idea is to see how medical colleges are functioning. By saying this, the Resolution contemplates medical colleges where modern medicine is taught. So it excludes the other medical eolleges where the Ayurvedic system of medicine and treatment is taught. There are a large number of medical colleges in our State where the Ayurvedic system of medicine and treatment are also taught and if the Hon'ble mover of the resolution had included these colleges also, I would certainly have thought of supporting the resolution without reservations. But since it is confined, though not in so many words, at least from the speeches that have been made is support of the resolution, to the working of colleges that are teaching modern medicine alone, we will have to carefully examine whether a case has been made out for a committee.

This question Sir, has been engaging the attention both of the Government of India and our State Government at various times. You are aware that the Bhore Committee went this matter and has submitted a report to the Government of India. It was a committee appointed by the Government of India to go into the question of Health Survey and Development in our country. They made certain recommendations. In that report, the state of affairs regarding medical education and public health in our country has been reviewed. And thereafter, under the Chairmanship of Dr. A. Lakshmanaswamy Mudaliar another committee was appointed to go into the Health Survey and Planning in the year 1959. In the year 1961, they also submitted a report, to the Government of India and that committee deals with medical education and also makes certain suggestions.

Coming to our State Sir, one of the predecessors of the present Health Minister appointed a committee to consider the reorganisation of medical education and health services in Mysore State. It was a single-member committee with Maj. General Bhatia. He submitted a report to our State Government. In that report the medical education in Mysore State, the functioning of the medical colleges and what improvements are required for the colleges, have been dealt with and the only private medical college then existing, the KASTURBA MEDICAL COLLEGE, had been exclu ed from the purview of this Report. But it deals with all the other Government Medical Colleges.

Maj. General Bhatia has been a Professor of physiology, hygiene, Dean of the College for 12 years, principal of group of hospitals for four years; Deputy Director-General of Health New Delhi for four years; Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals for two years, Surgeon-General in Madras for three years and Head of the Medical Department of Hyderabad for two years. He has been heading several University commissions for affiliation in our State. He has submitted a report and that report is a recent one.

So, there is no dearth of reports to tell us about standards according to which our medical colleges should function and our Medical education should be conducted. The only difficulty if at all is in the carrying out of the recommendations or enforcement of the recommendations of the various committees. It cannot be the intention of my hon. friend, the mover of the Resolution, to increase the number of reports by another one, without looking into the contents of the existing reports. The idea is that there are certain defects in the functioning or working of the Medical Colleges—both Government and Private, and that they must be set right. Let us see whether a committee is required at all to rectify or correct the mistakes or the wrong functioning that have been pointed out by several hon. Members of this House. Medical education was not introduced in our country by the Britisher. For the last two thousand years or more we had medical education in our country going by the names of 'Shushrutha' and '*Charaka*'. They are well-known systems of medicine. But this modern system of medicine was not known; it came with the Britisher. We have to concentrate ourselves on how this modern system of education is being taught to our students in the various colleges. First, it has been pointed out that in Mysore in the Government Colleges, there is no proper staff. It has also been pointed out that in some of the Government Colleges, equipment has not been properly calibrated or it is not being properly used. It was also pointed out, in the course of the debate, that some of these private Medical Colleges are up to the standard or more than the standard. The Manipal Medical College has more staff or more equipment than is normally necessary. For this purpose, is there need for appointing a committee to go into all these matters? Is there any need to have a report? I say, there is absolutely no need to appoint a committee because standards of education have been laid down by several committees, especially the Bhore Committee consisting of very illustrious medical men on it, and a similar second committee presided over by Dr. A. Lakshmanaswami Mudaliar. So, the standards have been laid down. It is for those who are in charge of these institutions to see that the standards are enforced; it is for them to maintain the requisite equipment. It is for the Universities to see that the standards are maintained. The University sends round affiliation commissions to all these colleges to see whether they have got qualified and experienced staff, whether they have got the necessary equipment and whether they have got all the accommodation needed. If they do not have the accommodation, equipment and staff, the College could be disaffiliated

(SRI K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA)

and the matter ends there. It is the University that can get these things done. A further committee to give a report whether in a particular college the anatomy section is functioning or not and whether the medicine section is properly functioning. These details could be found out by the University Affiliation Commission; in fact, it is their duty to find it out. So far as the standards of teaching are concerned, the University is there and it is better that the matter is pursued in some other form; a separate committee is not necessary to report on this.

Then, Sir, much has been stated about the question of fees, which are now popularly known as Capitation Fees. Even there, a special committee is not necessary at all. The University is handling the problem. The University itself can say, how much fee can be charged. It is the duty of the University to determine how much extra fee could be levied in technical and non-technical institutions; and the University is doing that job. Therefore, where is the need, I ask, for a separate committee to be appointed to go into these details.

Sri VISWANATHASWAMY.—If the hon. member yields, I wish to point out that because the Universities have failed to take any action in respect of these matters, this Resolution is introduced to see that things in the medical colleges are set right.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—The Universities have failed because they have given their seal of approval for this sort of functioning by the colleges. In that case; even a committee will be helpless.

Sri JEEVARAJ HIRACHAND SHAH.—That is why, efficiency is deteriorating day by day.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—The authority to prescribe the fee is the University and Mysore University have fixed Rs. 400 as the fee for Government Medical Colleges. In the Karnatak University, Rs. 1,200 is the term fee. In the Mysore University, they have said that the private colleges should not charge more than double the fee prescribed for Government institutions, that is not more than Rs. 800. After all, the fee must have some connection with the expenses necessary for running a college. Since the Members are interested in this question, you will kindly permit me to go into this question of capitation fee in detail. Our State is running some colleges. The Government is running four Medical Colleges. The Budget provision is: Rs. 17 lakhs for the Bangalore Medical College; Rs. 22 lakhs for the Mysore Medical College; Rs. 23 lakhs for the Hubli College; and Rs. 17 lakhs for the Bellary College. So, it comes to Rs. 79 lakhs for one year. And this is maintenance expenditure for running these four Colleges, which admit 700 students per year. This does not include the expenditure incurred on hospitals. This sum of Rs. 80 lakhs is only for the purpose of running these Medical Colleges which have provision for making 700 admissions. In our State, the private colleges also admit 700 students—an equal

number. So, 1,400 is the intake of the Medical Colleges in our State. 700 students in the Government Medical Colleges, for which we have to incur an annual expenditure of nearly Rs. 80 lakhs on colleges alone. The Government does not incur anything on the other 700 students admitted to the private Medical Colleges. Then, who is providing funds for the private Medical Colleges which admit 700 students? Their parents. So, nobody in this House can object to their parents pooling their own resources to educate their children provided there is nothing anti-national in what is taught there.

The payment made varies on the capacity of the person who is able to pay. In Delhi, I am told, there is a public school wherein even for the primary class Rs. 100 has got to be paid for admission fees and the President of India is himself a patron of that school. So, payment of higher money to educate their children is not objectionable, This capitation fee is not properly understood. The right to educate one's own child, by incurring whatever expenses is the right of the parents of the child. Sir, we are concerned with the principle here; there is nothing wrong. In our country we require more doctors. Has the State finances to provide at a stretch all the medical colleges we require to enable producing as many doctors as we require? If the State has to start these colleges and finance them, it requires several years to get the number of doctors required to man our hospitals and look after the sick. So, if certain parents join together and pay for the education of their own children, there is nothing wrong. I was asked as to what was meant by advance payment. At the beginning, when the boy or girl seeks admission, a lumpsum amount is taken from them; it varies between Rs. 3,000 and Rs. 5,000.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.—That is not the point; the only point is, if Rs. 5,000 is collected and receipt is passed for that amount and if it is accounted for, we have no grouse. But, more money is taken and receipt is passed for less amount and it is not accounted for. Is that a correct practice, is the point.

5-15. P.M.

Sri K SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—Sir, we are digressing from the subject matter itself. The resolution is whether the medical colleges function properly and whether a committee should go into the matter. Incidentally, the question of capitation fee came up. So, if you once concede that a fee can be taken from a parent sufficient to meet the education of their child, then, all hue and cry against capitation fee goes. If proper receipt is not passed for the money taken, it is a matter, as Sri Mallaradhya said, for the Vigilance Commission or the police if a complaint is lodged.

Sir, to educate a boy in an ordinary Arts College, Government spends Rs. 200 per head. In a Science College it will be Rs. 275 for each boy; in an Engineering College Government spends about Rs.1,500

(SRI K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA)

on each boy and to educate a boy in a medical college Government will be spending on each boy Rs. 3,000. Because of these private medical colleges, this burden on Government is taken away in so far as these 700 boys are concerned; it is shared by the parents. We are concerned only with the question as to whether they are functioning properly, whether they maintain the standard and the doctors that come out of those colleges are up to the standard laid down by the Universities. If they do not function properly, there is the university and the Government. If a person says that he will run a college and admit a person taking money and does not pass on the receipt, there are other friends who will show the way out and see that that person is landed in a court. I do not think it is a simple matter. I do not know why unneceslarily so much is made about it. If we get into a transport bus and pay the charge and the bus conductor does not issue ticket, we will not keep quiet. Not merely for that sake we will not say it should not be nationalised. Like that if there is anything in the private colleges, we must try to improve them. Simply because a conductor does not issue ticket he does not say it should not be nationalised.

Sri V. SRINIVASA SHETTY.— We say there should be proper control

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA—Simlarly in this case we should see that there is no profit motive. Unnecessarily it has been the habit to make it as an issue for debate. The question for the consideration of the House is, what we should do with these private colleges. The Government has already announced in the Draft Outline of the Fourth plan that it proposes to take over two colleges. So anything that the Government does,my friend has comments to make. Of course I do not find fault for it because in a democracy the opposition has to oppose everything. The Government has announced that it proposes to take over two medical colleges in the fourth plan. After the fourth plan is completed and if they do not take them over, then my friend can comment. Whatever it is, I for one would say that if the alleged malpractices are prevented there is no harm in a man who has got surplus money taking a seat and making his son a doctor. The State would not incur any expenditure. For running the four colleges including the hospitals the budget provision is 80 lakhs. If private medical colleges have to be taken over by the Government, the Government will have to spend 80 lakhs on medical education. So these parents of the students who are in the private medical colleges are sharing the burden. The next question comes about the mode of payment in the private colleges. It has been alleged or stated in this House that people without qualificati n or minimum qualification have been admitted. I do not know. Fortunately or unfortunately I am in the Mysore University for the last theree years and we have seen that no person who has not secured 45 per cent marks is admitted to any medical college within the university area. Similar rule is there in the Bangalore University and also in the Karnatak University. I do not know the basis

for the accusation made. There is a rule prescribing a minimum of 45 per cent marks. As far as the accusation that these private colleges admit sub-standard people and made as doctors goes, I may say for the information of the House because I happen to be the Mysore University nominee on the Governing Body of the Kasturba Gandhi Medical College that though the university has prescribed 45 per cent marks they have fixed 50 per cent. Under the Mysore University Act the Governing body of a private professional college should have a nominee of the Mysore University. I happen to be the nominee on the governing body of the Kasturba Medical College. They do not admit boys who have secured less than 50 per cent. Similarly there are other colleges. If they are allowed to function for three or four years, I am sure they will also raise the minimum to that level. Whatever it is, the fact is if a person secures less than what is prescribed he is not admitted.

SRI M. C. NARASIMHAN.—You may say that it is necessary to allow private medical colleges to charge this capitation fees. You seem to be opposed if Government charges capitation fees. Is it necessary for you to say that there should be uniformity in this matter of capitation fees? Either you fix the maximum so that the.....

SRI K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—My friend unnecessarily wants to interrupt my speech. A private school charges Rs. 25 whereas there is no fees in a corporation school. Why should Sri Mallaradhya send his grand children to such school? Where is uniformity there? So this question of lack of uniformity is not unconstitutional. Higher fees is levied because the State is not giving maintenance grant. For private Arts and Science College the State gives grant. To these private medical crlleges.....

SRI J. B. MALLARADHYA.—Which Arts and Science College takes grants? Please do not make comparison. The Governmeut does not give because they are taking capitation fees.

SRI K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—The Government is providing hospital facility. But with regard to these private colleges, the expenditure incurred for running the college and money required for the capital expenditure has to be met by the parents of the students. So far as capital expenditure is concerned they say capitation fees and running expenses which amounts for four Government colleges to Rs. 80 lakhs, is contributed by the students. If we are to charge Rs. 400, *i.e.*, the fee prescribed by the Mysore University or Rs. 600 which the Karnatak University has fixed in the Government colleges, then they cannot run the college because the cost of educating in medical college comes to Rs. 3,000. The Government gives hospital facility. To that extent there is reduction. That is why the private colleges charge Rs. 1,200, as Sri Bandi Gowda pointed out namely, Rs. 800 being charged in the Manipal and Davangere colleges and another Rs. 400 under some other name. The private colleges under the Karnatak University are permitted to charge Rs. 1,200 as tuition fees. These colleges without charging them cannot make both ends meet. When Manipal College came to Mysore University,...

Sri C. BANDI GOWDA (Teachers' Constituency).—The point I was stating was, these people collect this Rs. 400 in advance. They give in one lumpsum, years ahead and they were able to build a big fund.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—These are matters which the University itself can tackle. The University in a sense could have a uniform fee for all private Medical Colleges. Whatever it is, what I wish to submit is that these colleges have served a useful purpose. It is not only those boys who want to marry and want to get a good dowry that are admitted into these colleges but even those who want to pursue the profession or serve the country as doctors that are also adimtted. The private colleges are not started to enable these boys to earn a good dowry.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—In the marriage market this is what is happening though there is prevention of taking of dowry, the parents of the girls are out to get good boys and they are prepared to pay more money. I did not run down their idealism; several boys are studying not for dowry but are studying for the sake of knowledge.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—As I said, these private Medical Colleges are started not for the purpose of earning dowry but to disseminate medical education. It was pointed out that these colleges are admitting sub-standard boys. In the Government Colleges admissions are made on merit *i.e.*, on the performance in the Pre-University Examination. I have heard some friends objecting to that also. They ask, "Why should you say that those are the best boys who have secured the highest marks in the Pre-University Examination and why should they alone turn out to be good doctors ?". Even third-class graduates have succeeded very well in professions either as doctors or lawyers or High Court Judges and what is to happen to people ? Admission into Government Colleges is restricted to boys getting 70 per cent or so. What is to happen to a boy getting 60 per cent marks. I am only submitting that there are people who have got boys who are of average standard who have means to educate them; for them let us have private colleges minus the so called abuses. If today somebody comes and tells us that Rs. 50,000 is paid to get a seat for his son, I would not straightaway believe him because if really he has paid that amount, he would take some receipt. A man who would pay Rs. 50,000 would be a very big businessman paying income tax and to claim deduction he will do it. If the rules do not permit that, then he is party to a false transaction or fraud and how can you believe such a man when he comes and says that he has paid Rs. 50,000 ? It is on the statements of those people that my hon'ble Friend says that there are certain malpractices. There may be, but we have to see whether it is rampant. Because there are malpractices, are we to eliminate all these colleges ? The Hon'ble the Leader of the Opposition himself says that these institutions should be continued. This is one of the matters

which my friend the Mover wanted to be gone into by a committee to be appointed. This, I submit, is a matter which can be safely and well handled at the University level.

Sri C. BANDI GOWDA.—I would like my hon'ble friend to clarify a point. He has stated that nearly Rs. 80 lakhs would be required per year for these private colleges and on that basis I have calculated the annual expenditure for Kasturbai Medical College will be nearly Rs. 20 lakhs. There are 1,200 students studying in that college per year and they are collecting fees at the rate of Rs. 1,200 or so and the other fees of nearly Rs. 300 per student would just balance the expendtiture. Then, why have recourse to the capitation fee ?

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—I am not in a position to speak about the balance sheet of any particular college. If the question is posed, I can give an answer later on but the question is we have got to see what is the capital expenditure required.

Sri C. BANDI GOWDA.—Colleges which are well established do not require capital expenditure at this stage.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—No college is fully complete. For instance, take the Kasturbai Medical College. The college building in Mangalore was opened the other day but the hospital buildings are not yet complete. All these matters have to be gone into and the University will do it. For that a separate roving committee is not required. There are already so many committees and this will be one more committee whose report will remain unimplemented. My Hon'ble Friend Sri Bandi Gowda who moved the resolution said that in a particular college more boys were admitted, etc. How can this committee prevent such a thing from happening ? Admissions are controlled by the Affiliation Committee whose report is accepted by the University and concurred in by the Government. At times if the University recommends certain number of seats, the Government can increase or reduce it. The procedure followed in this behalf is well known. A couple of years ago 130 admissions were made in a college. Such a contingency may or may not arise. At times certain contingencies require a little closing of the eyes. For instance, the University has got a rule that any college which requires affiliation has to send an application by a certain date. Are there no instances where the application has been sent after that date ? The situation may be such. There may be rush of boys and there may not be accommodation in the college and then the rules will have to be waived. Because it happened once at Davangere, I do not think it is a justification for appointing a committee on that ground alone.

Sir, submissions were made that while appointing staff, people who are not qualified are appointed. It is again a matter of opinion. The appointments are by the appointing authority thinking that those persons are best suited to do the job, But, we think otherwise. This criticism has been there and will be there till the Dooms Day. If the

(SRI K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA)

Health Minister makes an appointment, it is suspected, if the Public Service Commission makes an appointment, it is suspected and even if the experts at the Bangalore University meet and make an appointment, it is also suspected. Then, who else is to appoint ? The appointments have to be made either by officers or Minister or P.S.C. or by a Committee of experts. Let us be charitable and say they are *bona fide* mistakes if there are any. My friend, Dr. Bandi Gowda mentioned about a person of the Primary Health Centre being appointed as a Lecturer in a Medical College. He did not give the details. Let us suppose that a qualified man, who is an M. D. or M. S. wanted the appointment, and there was no other appointment available. Circumstances might have forced him to work in the Primary Health Centre for some time.

Smt. M. R. LAKSHAMMA.—There is a proposal for capital expenditure in the form of buildings, because it is said that a School of Nursing is attached to the Kasturba General Hostel and the Nursing School is proposed to be upgraded into a College and buildings are coming up !

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—There might be some wrong appointments. It is the P.S.C. who makes appointments, and they are not a body of experts ; most of them are laymen. How are they to find out whether a particular person could do teaching very well. He may have the qualifications. Sometimes, people without proper degrees may be very good teachers and sometimes people with a dozen degrees may not be good teachers. Appointments are made with the best of intentions. Just because certain cases have happened like that, it is no ground for appointing a Committee to go into details. The cadre and recruitment rules have been formulated and the Government is recruiting teachers for this College. I feel that my friend, Dr. Bandi Gowda has got some imaginary grievance. At the same time, I for one would not be pleading that inefficient men should be put on the job. In the Medical Colleges, proper men must be there. If at present proper men for teaching are not there, it is because there were no cadre and recruitment rules. Now, that the Government have published the rules and the recruitment is going on, the other difficulty pointed out by Dr. Bandi Gowda in the functioning of the Medical Colleges will disappear soon, because duly qualified Doctors will be there. The Indian Medical Council is there, which has laid down standards and which is the official authority about qualifications, etc. Therefore, there is no necessity to get the report. If a person, without the qualifications is appointed and the University closes its eyes, how can this Report help ? The report regarding the standards to be maintained is not necessary in appointing the teaching personnel, because all those standards have been laid down by the Indian Medical Council. He also submitted as to what has to be done regarding post-graduate teaching.

Some committees have recommended what should be done regarding post-graduate teaching, and steps have already been taken. Rome was not built in a day. The Institute is progressing, hospital is there, staff is recruited and slowly it will develop. A beginning has been made and for that purpose a separate Committee to go into the matter is not needed, because the Government has decided as to what it should do. It was stated that appropriate scales of pay to the lecturers are required and my friend Dr. Bandi Gowda suggested the appointment of a Committee for this purpose. The Pay Commission is there, the Indian Medical Council has prescribed the standards and the University Grants Commission is there to fix proper scales of pay to the teaching personnel. Therefore, there is absolutely no need for appointing a Committee.

My friend, Sri V. Srinivasa Shetty said that the teaching staff should be of a certain standard. There cannot be difference of opinion on this issue. Everybody feels that the teaching staff should be of a proper standard. We do make a mistake sometimes while appointing personnel. Steps have been taken and we must compliment the Hon'ble Minister for Health for getting the rules drafted, publishing them and going ahead with the recruitment. I am sure several of the criticisms would not have come up before the House if this discussion had not been adjourned by two months. Now all the Medical Colleges have been staffed by proper personnel and there would be no occasion at all to level any criticism against the way the Colleges have been functioning.

5-45 P.M.

Then, a criticism was made that research work is not done in our Government Medical Colleges. I find the same remark has been made in the reports of the various Committees that have been appointed by the Government of India. It is a remark not only against our College, but it is against all other Government Colleges. I would only read one sentence from the Bhore Committee Report: 'Medical Reseach requires a little more attention in the Medical Colleges of India.' In our State we did not have the required number of Colleges. First, our effort has been to start the required number of Medical Colleges. Then, the question of research comes in, and therefore, the Research Institutes are being set up. And one of the persons, who gave evidence before the Committee, Dr. A. V. Hill said that, in the Medical Colleges which he visited since coming to India, research was almost non-existent.

[MR. VICE-CHAIRMAN (SRI M. GOVARDHAN RAO) in the Chair]

That was about 25 years ago. Now steps have been taken. Research has got to be made. For that account, the question is whether it is to be entrusted to ordinary Medical College which undertakes graduate training or it should be entrusted to specialised bodies which do only research work. There are two opinions expressed here in this connection. One opinion is that you cannot isolate graduate

(SRI K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA)

teaching from research institutions because it would be a good atmosphere both for the under-graduates and also for research work. Another opinion is, this research work must be taken away from the degree Medical Colleges because the research degree is not interested in what an undergraduate is trying to learn here. Therefore, it is a problem that has got to be tackled. For this Post-graduate research work a separate institute has been proposed to be set up, but the only thing is the work has not been taken up. If this problem is solved, I am sure that this criticism will not be available later. So, I respectfully submit that there is absolutely no case made out here for the appointment of a Committee. The matter regarding the fees has been discussed and if the concerned authorities, the Government regarding the Government Medical College, and the University regarding the Private Medical Colleges, make up their mind to see that the proper fee structure is maintained, then nobody in this House or outside would have any grievances. If these two bodies do not exercise the powers conferred upon them, then no amount of reports from any number of Committees are going to help us in this matter. Regarding the other private Colleges, I know nothing about the collection of fees, etc. So far as the Manipal Medical College is concerned I know something more than anybody else here because, I am the representative of the University. This College is run by a Registered Body. They are maintaining accounts. I am in the governing body as a University representative. The Government also has a representative there and other public men are also there. Every month they collect fees, issue receipts and they maintain accounts in a perfect condition. The Registered body meets and checks all these things. Whatever they receive, will be accounted for. We cannot say that so much is paid without voucher. That has not happened in Manipal. We do not know about others. We should not unnecessarily believe in rumours. Everything will be scrutinised by this body. Therefore, there is no truth in saying that money collected will not be accounted for.

Sri K. PUTTASWAMY. Since you are on the governing body of the Manipal Medical College, I want you to clarify one point that has been raised by Dr. Bandi Gowda. Dr. Bandi Gowda said they have employed more staff than what is necessary. If that is a fact how an institution can employ more persons than what is required, and how it is justifiable ? On account of this fact that they have employed more staff than what is necessary, we believe that more money than what is necessary is being collected.

Sri J. B. MALLARADHYA.—They have imported staff. They believe that more number of staff will improve the standard of efficiency.

ಶ್ರೀ ಎ. ಎಚ್. ಶಿವಾನಂದಸ್ವಾಮಿ.—ಮೆಡಿಕಲ್ ಕಾಲೇಜುಗಳ ಅಪಾಯಿಂಟ್‌ಮೆಂಟ್‌ಗಳನ್ನು ತಮ್ಮ ಅವಗಾಹನೆಗೆ ತೆಗೆದುಕೊಂಡು ಬಂದು ತಮ್ಮ ಒಪ್ಪಿಗೆ ಪಡೆದುಮೇಲೆ ತಾನೆ

ಮಾಡಿರುವುದು ? ದಾವಣಗೆರೆಯಿದು ತಪ್ಪುಗೆ ಗೊತ್ತಿಡೆ, ತಮ್ಮ ಹತ್ತಿರ ಬಂದಿದ್ದವರು ಅಂತ ಕಾಣುತ್ತದೆ, ತಾವು ಒಪ್ಪಿಗೆ ಕೊಟ್ಟಮೇಲೆ ರಿಪ್ರೆಸೆಂಟೇಷನ್ ಎಷ್ಟಿರಬೇಕೋ ಅದಕ್ಕೂ ಅವರು ಮಾಡುತ್ತಾ ಇರುವುದಕ್ಕೂ ವ್ಯತ್ಯಾಸ ಇದೆ.

ಶ್ರೀ ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟಸ್ವಾಮಿ.—ಮಾನ್ಯ ಸದಸ್ಯರು ದಾವಣಗೆರೆ ಕಾಲೇಜಿನ ವಿಷಯ ಪ್ರಸ್ತಾಪ ಮಾಡಿದ್ದಾರೆ, ಅಲ್ಲಿ ನೇಮಕ ಮಾಡಿಕೊಳ್ಳುವುದಕ್ಕೆ ನಾವೇನೂ ಹೊಣೆ ಅಲ್ಲ, ನಮ್ಮಲ್ಲಿರತಕ್ಕವರು ಅವರಿಗೆ ಏನಾದರೂ ಬೇಕಾಗಿದ್ದರೆ ಅವರಿಗೆ ನಮ್ಮವರನ್ನು ಎರವಲು ಕೊಡಬೇಕಾಗಿದ್ದರೆ ಅವರು ನಮ್ಮ ಹತ್ತಿರ ಬರಬೇಕು. ನಮ್ಮ ಹತ್ತಿರ ಇರುವವರು ಯಾರಾದರೂ ರಾಜೀನಾಮೆ ಕೊಡುತ್ತೇವೆ ಎಂದು ಹೇಳಿದರೆ ನಾವು ಒಪ್ಪಿಕೊಳ್ಳುವುದಿಲ್ಲ. ಅವರು ಇಂಥವರನ್ನು ಬಿಡುಗಡೆ ಮಾಡಿಕೊಡಿ ಎಂದು ಹೇಳಬಹುದು. ನಮ್ಮ ಹತ್ತಿರ ಕಾಂಟ್ರಾಕ್ಟ್, ಇರುತ್ತದೆ, ಪ್ರೋಸ್ಪೆಗ್ಟಾಜುಯೇಟ್ ಕೋರ್ಸ್ ಓದುತ್ತೇವೆ ಎಂದು ಹೇಳಿದಾಗ ಅನೇಕ ವಿಧದಲ್ಲಿ ಅವರಿಗೆ ಸಹಾಯ ಮಾಡಿರುತ್ತೇವೆ. ಒಂದು ಒಪ್ಪಿಕೊಂಡ ಅವಧಿ ಇರುತ್ತದೆ, ಆ ಅವಧಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ಅವರನ್ನು ರಿಲೀಸ್ ಮಾಡಿಕೊಡುವುದಕ್ಕಾಗುವುದಿಲ್ಲ. ಆದ್ದರಿಂದ ಅವರು ಯಾರನ್ನು ನೇಮಕ ಮಾಡಬೇಕು ಬಿಡಬೇಕು ಎಂಬುದು ಅವರ ವಿವೇಚನೆಗೆ ಬಿಟ್ಟಿದ್ದು.

ಶ್ರೀ ಎ. ಎಚ್. ಶಿವಾನಂದಸ್ವಾಮಿ.—ತಮ್ಮ ಹತ್ತಿರ ಲಸ್ಟ್ ತಗೆದುಕೊಂಡು ಬಂದಿದ್ದರಲ್ಲಾ ಅದರಲ್ಲಿ ಎನು ಸಲಹೆ ಕೊಟ್ಟಿದ್ದಾರೆ ಅಂತ ?

Sri K. PUTTASWAMY.—That is a different matter. The authorities of the Davangere College have selected some people who are with us. I am considering that. If the Hon'ble member has listened the debate here, He would have come to know all these things.

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—Sir, it has been stated that there has been overstaffing in the Manipal College. Unfortunately Dr. Bandi Gowda did not give the details about it. He was the person who went and saw things actually.

Mr. VICE-CHAIRMAN.—How much time the member like to take to conclude ?

Sri K. SURYANARAYANA ADIGA.—I want some time more.

Mr. VICE-CHAIRMAN.—The House will now rise and meet to-morrow at 9 A.M.

The House adjourned at Six of the Clock to meet again at Nine of the Clock on Saturday, the 9th March 1968.

WD 10557—GPB—600—6-8-1968